

केन्द्रीय सूचना आयोग
CentrAI Information Commission
बाबागंगनाथमार्ग, मुनिरका
Baba Gangnath Marg, Munirka
नई दिल्ली, New Delhi-110067

द्वितीय अपील संख्या / Second Appeal Nos.: File nos.

CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107327
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107328
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107329
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107330
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107331
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107332
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107333
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107334
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107335
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107336
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107337
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107338

CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107339
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107340
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107341
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107342
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107343
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107344
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107345
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107346
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107347
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107348
CIC/ABQAS/A/2019/107349/AIRIN
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107350
CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107351

Deeksha Chaudhary
Flat No.254, Bahawalpur Apartments,
Plot No.1, Sector-4, Dwarka,
New Delhi-110078

... अपीलकर्ता / Appellant

Versus

Central Public Information Officer,
Air India Limited
Crew Management System,
GSD Complex, IGI AirPort T -2,
New Delhi- 110037

...प्रतिवादीगण / Respondent

Date of Decision : 28.12.2020

Chief Information Commissioner : Shri Y. K. Sinha

Case No.	Date of RTI	CPIO reply	First Appeal dated	FAA's Order dated	Second Appeal filed on
107327	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107328	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107329	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107330	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019

107331	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107332	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107333	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107334	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107327	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107335	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107336	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107337	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107338	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107339	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107340	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107341	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107342	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107343	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107344	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107345	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107346	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107347	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107348	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107349	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019
107351	10.08.2018	14.09.2018	08.10.2018	15.11.2018	18.02.2019

Note: The present batch of Appeals as listed above in Annexure 1A is preferred by the same Appellant (list attached). Since the issues involved in the present Appeals as well as relief sought are identical in nature, the Commission proposes to club these said matters and adjudicate upon them together through this common order for the sake of brevity and avoidance of multiple proceedings.

Information sought and background of the case

(1)CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107327

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. A total of how many Cabin crew reported fatigue to CMS before a flight between dates 01/01/2017 and 31/01/2018?
2. Of All the cabin crew who reported fatigue to CMS between dates 01/01/2017 and 31/01/2018 for how many Cabin crew was their next assignment removed on the ARMS system?
3. Provide certified copy of protocol in place/guidelines followed by CMS staff when a cabin crew reports a state of fatigue to CMS.
4. Provide a certified copy of guidelines provided by Flight Safety Department to CMS, detailing action to be taken when a Cabin crew reports fatigue?

5. *What action was taken by Mr. Nautiyal - Duty Manager CMS upon receipt of email from on 01/02/2018 at 0130 hrs., bearing subject "reporting fatigued" (attached as 'Annexure-A')*
6. *Did Mr.Nautiyal forward my email attached as Annexure – A to inform*
 - a) *any CMS official? If yes provide details of to whom and what time was it forwarded?*
 - b) *DGCA Nodal Officer (Boeing)*
 - c) *Flight Safety Department*
 - d) *Directorate General of Civil Aviation*
7. *Reference is made to email sent to the undersigned on 01/02/2018 at 04:07am byMr. C.P Nautiyal Duty Manager - CMS (attached as 'Annexure-B')*
 - a) *Was the content of this email provided to Mr. Nautiyal by any other CMS official through official communication channels?*
 - b) *provide copy of document that details "necessary action" mentioned in the email*
 - c) *Is Duty Manager CMS authorised to take the "necessary action" mentioned in the email.*
 - d) *provide certified copy of circular FSD13-36/341 mentioned in the email'*
8. *Since 07/08.2017 till 31/01/2018 how many crew who reported fatigue were sent an e-mail by CMS advising them to refer to circular FSD/13-36/341 dated 07.08.2017 uploaded on ARMS and follow the procedure mentioned in the circular?*
9. *Provide Copy of instructions issued to CMS staff which instructs them to refer any cabin crew who reports fatigue to circular FSD/13-36/341 dated07.08.2017 uploaded on ARMS and follow the procedure mentioned in the circular.*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(2) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107328

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. *Provide name and staff Number of all cabin crew that operated from Delhi flight AI-933 of 31.1.2018.*
2. *For each cabin crew that operated from Delhi flight AI-933 of 31-1-2018 give details of the date and time the duty was assigned on arms to each individual.*
3. *Provide name, staff number and duty timings of all cabin crew who undertook Airport Standby Duty on 30,01.2018*
4. *Provide name, staff number and duty timings of all cabin crew who undertook Airport standby Duty on 31.01.2018.*
5. *For each such cabin crew that undertook Airport Standby on 30th & 31st January, 2018, provide the following details:*

- a) AIRCRAFT TYPE qualified to operate?
 - b) Total number of hours flown from 31.1.2017 to 30.01.2018.
 - c) Flight assigned/pulled out for while doing AIRPORT SBY.
 - d) What other assignment done by them on 31.01.2017?
6. Provide name and staff number of all 787 qualified cabin crew who did home standby duty third shift; STB-WBSB3 on 30.01.2018 (from 1901IST 30.01.18 to 0300 IST 31/01/18).
 7. Provide name and staff number of All 787 qualified cabin crew who did home standby duty first shift; STB-WBSB1 on 31.01.2018.

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(3) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107329

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. In the email attached as 'Annexure -A' sent to my husband by Mr. Neeraj
 - a) Who all except Mr. Neeraj comprise the "we" mentioned by the Duty Manager?
 - b) What exact document is asked for in the phrase "send the document".
 - c) What exact document is referred to in the phrase "without the document"

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(4) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107330

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. Between 2145 hours on 30.01.2018 to 0600 hours on 31.01.2018, a total of howmany Cabin crew were marked sick (SL) on the ARMS system?
2. Between 2145 hours on 30.01.2018 to 0600 hours on 31.01.2018 a total of Howmany crew member informed CMS of their sickness via email?
3. Between 2145 hours on 30.01.2018 to 0600 hours on 31.01.2018 of all cabin crewwho informed CMS of their sickness via e-mail a total of how many were sent anemail response by Duty Manager CMS asking them to submit documents immediately?
4. Between 2145 hours on 30.01.2018 to 0600 hours on 31.01.2018 of al cabin crewwho informed CMS of their sickness via e-mail a total of how many were sent anemail response by Duty Manager CMS informing them that without sending copy of documents it won't be possible to grant leave.

5. *Between 2145 hours on 30.01 .2018 to 0600 hours on 31.01.2018 Of all cabin crewwho informed CMS of their sickness via e-mail a total of how many were marked S Lon the ARMS system?*
6. *Between 2145 hours on 30.01.2018 to 0600 hours on 31.01. 2018 Of all cabin crewwho informed CMS of their sickness via e-mail for a total of how many crew wastheir next immediate assignment removed from the ARMS system?*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(5) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107331

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. *As per the ARMS system is there a visa requirement for cabin crew to operate flights to the UNITED KINGDOM?*
2. *As per ARMS system is the undersigned in possession of the required visa to operate flights to UNITED KINGDOM?*
3. *Provide copy of instructions to PLANNING section of CMS, Not to assign the undersigned flight patterns AI 123, AI 161 and AI 103 except when bid?*
4. *Provide copy of instructions to PLANNING section of CMS not to assign the undersigned flights of more than 30 hours layover duration on sectors operated by the Boeing-787Aircraft?*
5. *Provide copy of instructions to PLANNING Department of CMS not to assign theundersigned flights with two or more clear days layover on any sector on the companynetwork.*
6. *Provide certified copy of instructions to planning department of CMS to assign the undersigned AI-161after every ULH flight assignment.*
7. *Provide certified copy of instructions to planning department of CMS to assign the undersigned AI-933 after every ULH flight assignment.*
8. *List all flights bid by the undersigned between dates 01/08/2017 and 31/03/2018.*
9. *List all bid flights operated by the undersigned between dates 01/08.2017 and31/02/2018.*
10. *Between dates 01/08/2017 and 31/03/2018 list all flights leaving Delhi operated ona Sunday by the undersigned?*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(6) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107332

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. As on 28/02/2018 what was the total sanctioned strength of CMS department?
2. As on 28/02/2018 atotal of how many staff (permanent & contractual) were employed in CMS department?
3. As on 28/02/2018 total of how many female staff (permanent & contractual) were employed in CMS department?
4. Provide copy of instructions to CMS staff asking them to force cabin crew to breach doctor patient confidentiality and ask for detailed copies of their personal medical documents from personal confidential medical files?
5. Which of the following CMS Duty managers has been given an official training course to enable them to read findings & opinions of other medical professionals in order to:
 - * ascertain severity of sickness
 - * interpret specialist medical diagnosis & prescriptions
 - * Interpret line of treatment (both: followed & suggested)
 - i) Mr. Himanshu Chopra
 - ii) Mr. Neeraj
 - iii) Mr. Nautiyal
6. Give names of all staff employed in CMS department who as per company records are:
 - M.B.B.S degree holders
 - Registered medical practitioners

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(7) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107333

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. As per applicable service regulations for Air India Employees what is the definition of CASUAL LEAVE?
2. As per applicable Service Regulations for Air India employees can CASUAL LEAVE be availed during sickness?
3. Provide Certified Copy of guidelines followed by employees in CMS department to grant, refuse, revoke leave of Cabin Crew.
4. Regarding the emails sent by the undersigned on 24/01/2018 bearing subject "Request for Casual leave" (Attached as Annexure-A)

Provide details of all email addresses with date and time to whom my leave application was forwarded by concerned CMS staff.

- a) Was the leave applied for granted or refused?
- b) Provide certified copy of communication sent to the undersigned informing that the leave applied for has been refused?

- c) Provide Certified copy of the reason of refusal of leave communicated to the undersigned by CMS.
5. As on 31/01/2018 Did the undersigned have pre approved CASUAL LEAVE on 4,5,6 February 2018 reflected on ARMS system?
 6. Who approved the Casual Leave granted to the undersigned for dates 4,5& 6 February 2018?
 7. Was the sanctioning authority/ manager concerned informed by CMS regarding the cancellation of my casual leave of 4,5 & 6 February 2018?
 - a) If "yes" provide Certified copy of the communication sent.
 8. Give the date and time when for the undersigned CL of 4,5&6 February 2018 was changed to SL on the ARMS system?
 9. Give Name, designation and staff number of CMS staff whose login Id. was used to alter my CL of 4,5,6 February 2018 to SL?
 - a) Provide Certified copy of instructions issued to him/her to mark the undersigned on SL for a period beginning 31/01/2018.
 - b) On 31/01/2018 Provide name and staff number of the duty manager CMS on duty when the undersigned was marked on SL on ARMS.
 10. Provide certified copy of instructions/authority letter granting special privileges to Abhishek Bishtat CMS to change the type of leave applied for; in contravention to the provisions of Air India Employees Service Regulation chapter IX LEAVE.

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(8) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107334

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. Provide the name and staff number of CMS employee whose login Id was used to remove flight assignments AI-161 of 05.3.2018 and AI-103 of 09.3.2018 from the ARMS system for the undersigned.
2. Provide the name and staff number of CMS employee whose login ID was used to remove the flight assignment AI-127 of 26-2-2018 from the ARMS system for the undersigned
3. Did the undersigned bid for flight pattern AI-127 of 26-02-2018? If "Yes" Provide
 - i) Certified copy of the bid slip/ record
 - ii) date on which the flight was bid by the undersigned
 - iii) date and time when the bid was entered in the ARMS system

4. *On What date and time were the following flight assignments removed from the ARMS system for the undersigned*
 - a) *AI-161 of 05.03.2018*
 - b) *AI-103 of 09.03.2018*
 - c) *AI-127 of 26.02.2018*
5. *Upon removal of flight assignments AI-161 of 05.3.2018 and AI-103 of 09.3.2018 from the ARMS system for the undersigned. What new duties were assigned to the undersigned on ARMS system for dates 1 .03.2018 to 10-03-2018.*
6. *Provide the name and staff number of CMS employee whose login Id was used on the ARMS system to assign the undersigned flight pattern AI-101 of 24.02.2018*
7. *Who was the Duty Manager on duty at CMS when the flight assignment AI-127 of 26.02.2018 was removed from the ARMS system for the undersigned?*
8. *Who was the Duty Manager on duty at CMS when flight pattern AI-101 of 24.02.2018 was assigned to me on the ARMS system?*
9. *Provide Certified copies of All emails sent by CII/S to the undersigned between dates 1.1.2018 and 5.3.2018*
10. *Provide Certified copies of All emails sent by CMS to IFS DEPARTMENT regarding the undersigned between 12.12.2016 & 05.3.2018.*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(9) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107335

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. *Upon receipt of emails sent by my husband at 21:14hrs on 30/01/2018 (attached as 'Annexure- A') did Mr. Neeraj, Duty Manager CMS:*
 - i) *inform CCMCO Delhi by means of official communication that I am not at my residence and instead admitted in hospital*
 - ii) *Inform Transport Section by means of official communication that I am not at my residence and instead admitted in hospital*
 - iv) *Inform IOCC by means of official communication that I am not at my residence and instead admitted in hospital*
 - iv) *Inform Hub control that I am not at my residence and instead admitted in hospital*
2. *What action was taken by Mr. Neeraj, Duty Manager CMS upon receipt of the email sent at 21.14hrs by my husband to email id*

wbccdopsdel@gmail.com bearing subject 'Request for one day CL'?

3. *Who authorised Mr. Neeraj, Duty Manager - CMS to send company transport to my residence for flight AI-933 of 31/01/2018?*
4. *Since 31/01/2018 has any disciplinary action been taken against Mr. Neeraj – Duty Manager CMS?*
5. *Since 31/01/2018 has any superior CMS official, recommended recovery from the salary of Mr. Neeraj, Duty Manager CMS the financial loss caused to the company due to his actions?*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(10) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107336

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. *Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many AI -121 flights were operated from Delhi?*
2. *Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many AI - 306 flights were operated from Delhi?*
3. *Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many AI -153 flights were operated from Delhi?*
4. *Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many AI - 135 flights were operated from Delhi?*
5. *Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many AI -173 flights were operated from Delhi?*
6. *Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many AI - 302 flights were operated from Delhi?*
7. *Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many AI -103 flights were operated from Delhi?*
8. *Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many AI - 123 flights were operated from Delhi?*
9. *Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many AI - 308 flights were operated from Delhi?*
10. *Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many AI - 137 flights were operated from Delhi?*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(11) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107337

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. *Provide the name and All official contact details (telephone, e-mail & postal address) of*

- a) DGM IFS
 - b) DGM CMS
2. Reference is made to e-mail from Abhishek Bisht dated 31.01.2018 (attached as Annexure-A)
 - a) provide certified copy of instructions issued by DGM IFS/CMS to grant the undersigned one day EL.
 - b) Provide Certified copy of instructions issued by DGM IFS/CMS to assign the undersigned AI-302 of 011A212018
 - c) Provide certified copy of instructions issued on 31/01/2018 to remove for the undersigned the SL reflecting on the ARMS system.
 - d) Provide the name and staff number of duty manager CMS on duty when the instructions mentioned in the email were issued by DGM IFS/CMS,
 3. Provide certified copy of communication from CMS to DGM IFS/CMS informing that the undersigned has been marked SL on the ARMS system?
 4. Provide certified copy of communication from CMS from CMS to DGM IFS/CMS informing that the undersigned had pre approved CL on 4,5 and 6 February, 2018.
 5. Provide certified copy of communication from CMS to DGM IFS/CMS informing that the undersigned had requested for casual leave for 31.01.2018 due medical reasons/hospitalization.

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(12) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107338

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. What does EL reflected on ARMS PORTAL mean?
 - a) Provide the page Number, Chapter and Para number where the said EL is found in AirIndia Employees Service Regulations.
 - b) Is EL reflected on arms system paid leave?
2. Provide Certified copy of procedures published for cabin crew to request for EL
3. How many EL can a crew member avail in 355 days/financial year? Provide Certified copy of document that corroborates the reply.
4. Can EL be clubbed with any other type of Leave?
5. Minimum how many days in advance is a crew member supposed to apply for EL?
6. From 01/01/2017 to 31.1.2018 a total of how many Cabin crew were granted EL by official staff of CMS department.

- a) Provide the names of all crew members who were granted EL between 1.1.2017 to 28.2.2018.
7. For each crew member granted EL by CMS officials/staff between 01/01/2017 and 28.02.2017. Provide
- the date when each crew applied for EL.
 - at what time On what date was each EL sanctioned
 - name, designation and staff number of sanctioning authority.
 - EL was granted for which dates?
 - What was the FIRST duty {SBY OR FLIGHT} undertaken by each crew member after availing EL.
8. Between 01/01/2017 & 28/02/2018 a total of How many Cabin crew provided relevant supporting documents after their EL was sanctioned?
9. A total of How many cabin crew were sanctioned EL on instructions of DGM IFS/CMS between 1.1.2017 & 28.2.2018.
10. A total of How many cabin crew were sanctioned EL on instructions of Duty Manager CMS between 1.1.2017 & 28.2.2018.
11. Provide name and staff number of all cabin crew who were granted EL by Mr. Nautiyal, Duty Manager CMS between 1.1.2017 to 28.02.2018.
12. Provide name and staff number of All cabin crew who were granted EL by Mr. Neeraj, Duty Manager CMS between 1.1.2017 to 28.02.2018
13. Provide name and staff number of all cabin crew who were granted EL by duty manager CMS Mr. Himanshu Chopra between 1.1.2017 to 28.02.2018.

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(13) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107339

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

- Provide the date and time when on the ARMS system the undersigned was assigned flight pattern AI-933 of 1st February 2018.
- Provide the name, designation and staff number of CMS staff whose login ID was used on the ARMS system to assign the undersigned flight pattern AI-933 of 1st February 2018.
- Provide the name and staff number of Duty Manager CMS on duty when the undersigned was assigned flight pattern AI-933 of 1st February 2018'
- Provide the date and time when on the ARMS system assigned flight pattern AI-933 of 1st February 2018 was removed for the undersigned.

5. Provide the name, designation and staff number of CMS staff whose login ID was used on the ARMS system to remove flight pattern AI-933 of 1st February 2018 for the undersigned.
 - a) Provide certified copy of instructions issued to concerned CMS staff to remove from ARMS system flight pattern AI-933 of 01.02.2018 assigned to me.
 6. Provide the name and staff number of Duty Manager CMS on duty when the assigned flight pattern AI-933 of 1st February 2018 was removed for the undersigned.
 7. Provide Certified Copy of instructions issued to planning department of CMS and scheduling officers stating that in case a cabin crew is marked SL on the ARMS system the same shall be marked from the effective date till the date the roster is released upto.
 8. Provide Certified Copy of instructions issued to planning department of CMS and scheduling officers that in case a cabin crew is marked SL on the ARMS system All assignments of the cabin crew from the effective date of SL till the date the roster is released up to should be removed.
 9. When a crew member reports sick, as per standard practice CMS staff reflects the same on ARMS system for a period of how many days?
 - a) Provide Certified copy of guidelines followed by CMS staff to mark a cabin crew SL on ARMS system.
 10. Provide the dates for which the undersigned was marked SL on ARMS system on 31/01/2018?
 11. For 31/01/2018 Give the name and staff number of the Duty Manager CMS on duty when the undersigned was marked SL on ARMS system.
- (Queries reproduced verbatim)*

(14) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107340

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. Provide the total number of cabin crew that reported sick by sending e-mail to CMS on the following dates:
 - a) 30.01.2018
 - b) 31.01.2018
 - c) 01.02.2018

2. *Of the total number of cabin crew who reported sick on 30.01.2018 by sending e-mail to CMS how many were marked SL on the ARMS system?*
3. *Of the total number of cabin crew who reported sick on 30.01.2018 by sending e-mail to CMS for how many was the next assignment/ duty removed on ARMS system?*
4. *Of the total number of cabin crew who reported sick on 30.01.2018 by sending e-mail to CMS how many were sent an e-mail by Duty Manager CMS advising them to contact Air India doctor immediately.*
5. *Of the total number of cabin crew who reported sick on 31.01.2018 by sending e-mail to CMS how many were marked SL on the ARMS system?*
6. *Of the total number of cabin crew who reported sick on 31.01.2018 by sending e-mail to CMS for how many was the next assignment/ duty removed on ARMS system?*
7. *Of the total number of cabin crew who reported sick on 31.01.2018 by sending e-mail to CMS how many were sent an e-mail by Duty Manager CMS advising them to contact Air India doctor immediately.*
8. *Of the total number of cabin crew who reported sick on 01.02.2018 by sending e-mail to CMS how many were marked SL on the ARMS system?*
9. *Of the total number of cabin crew who reported sick on 01.02.2018 by sending e-mail to CMS for how many was the next assignment/ duty removed on ARMS system?*
10. *Of the total number of cabin crew who reported sick on 01.02.2018 by sending e-mail to CMS how many were sent an e-mail by Duty Manager CMS advising them to contact Air u India doctor immediately.*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(15) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107341

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. *Provide Name and Staff Number of all duty managers who did duty at CMS on 24/01/2018*

2. *Provide certified copy of record of attendance of all duty managers who did duty at CMS on 24.1.2018*
3. *Reference is made to Email sent by the undersigned on 24.1.2018 to wbccdopsdel@gmail.com at 14:22 hours (attached as annexure-A)*
 - a) *What action was initiated upon receiving the e-mail & by whom?*
 - b) *Was the above email forwarded to any email ID? If 'yes' provide Certified copy of the same?*
 - c) *Was any reply or acknowledgement sent to the undersigned in response to the email attached as Annexure-A*
 - d) *Provide Certified copy of any reply or acknowledgement sent to the undersigned in response email attached as Annexure-A*
4. *Was the request for leave by the undersigned in e-mail attached as Annexure-A refused? If 'yes'*
 - a) *provide the name and staff number of the Duty Manager at CIVIS who gave the instructions to refuse the leave*
 - b) *Provide a Certified copy of the reason thereof communicated to the undersigned for the refusal of leave.*
5. *Reference is made to the reminder email sent by the undersigned on 24.01.2018 to wbccdopsdel@gmail.com at 17.14 hours (attached as annexure -B).*
 - a) *What action was initiated upon receiving the email and by whom?*
 - b) *Was the above email forwarded to any email ID? If, yes, provide certified copy of the same?*
 - c) *Was any reply or acknowledgement sent to the undersigned in response to the email attached as Annexure-B.*
 - d) *Provide certified copy of any reply or acknowledgement sent to the undersigned in response email attached as annexure-B.*
6. *Was the request for leave by the undersigned in email attached as Annexure-B refused? If yes*
 - a) *Provide the name and staff number of the Duty Manager at CMS who gave the instructions to refuse the leave.*
 - b) *Provide a certified copy of the reason thereof communicated to the undersigned for the refusal of leave.*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(16) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107342

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. Does CMS department follow Air India service Regulations to grant, refuse, revoke leave for cabin crew?
2. Provide certified copy of laid down guidelines/rules followed by officials and staff of CMS department to grant refuse, revoke leave to cabin crew.
3. Provide certified copy of document that details the procedure to be followed by CMS staff to intimate cabin crew in case leave is:
 - a) granted
 - b) refused
 - c) revoked
4. How does CMS department inform cabin crew of refusal of leave?
5. Provide name, staff number & designation of all authorities in CMS department who empowered to grant leave to cabin crew?
6. Does there exist a laid down standard procedure to be followed by all cabin crew when approaching CMS for leave?
7. Provide certified copy of the circular/office order issued informing all cabin crew of the procedure to be followed when approaching CMS for Leave?
8. Is the Duty Manager CMS an empowered authority to:
 - a) Grant Leave
 - b) Refuse Leave
 - c) Revoke Leave
9. Provide certified copy of the official document based on which Duty Manager at CMS is authorised to:
 - a) Grant Leave
 - b) Refuse Leave
 - c) Revoke Leave
10. As per applicable Air India Service Regulations are grounds of sickness eligible grounds for a cabin crew to avail Casual Leave?

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(17) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107343

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. A total of how many emails were sent by duty manager Mr. Neeraj using e-mail ID wbccdoosdel@gmail.com while on duty on

the night of 30.1.2018 up to 0600 hours on 31.01.2018 in the morning.

- 2. A total of how many Cabin crew were sent e-mails by duty Manager Mr. Neeraj using email ID wbccdorsdel@gmail.com while on duty on the night of 30'1' 2018 up to 0600 hours on 31.01.2018 in the morning.*
- 3. Provide copy of instructions to Mr. Neeraj that instruct him NOT to grant leave to any cabin crew without documents.*
- 4. Provide copy of instructions to Mr. Neeraj not to grant any leave to the undersigned without documents.*
- 5. Provide copy of instructions authorizing Mr. Neeraj to mark crew members 5L on ARMS PORTAI without documents*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(18) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107344

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

- 1. Provide list of documents which are considered acceptable by Duty Manager CMS to give leave to Cabin crew on medical grounds.*
- 2. Provide copy of instructions to Duty Manager CMS stating admission slip of a hospital is not an admissible document to grant leave to Cabin crew?*
- 3. Provide AIL official email addresses of CMS department.*
- 4. Provide all e-mail addresses on which a cabin crew can communicate with CMS to report sick.*
- 5. Provide certified copy of the laid down standard procedure to be followed by CMS staff when a cabin crew reports sick through an e-mail to CMS.*
- 6. Provide certified copy of instructions to CMS staff stating not to remove next assignment of cabin crew who report sick via email to CMS; till proof of sickness is provided by the cabin crew reporting sick via email?*
- 7. Provide Certified copy of instructions to CMS staff stating not to remove next assignment of cabin crew who report sick via email to CMS; till instructions of Air India doctor on the same are received (directly or indirectly) by CMS.*
- 8. Provide Certified copy of instructions to CMS staff instructing them to send company transport for next assignment to the residence of all cabin crew who report sick via email.*

9. Provide Certified copy of instructions to CMS staff instructing them to advise all cabin crew who report sick via email to CMS, to contact Air India doctor immediately.

10. As regards cabin crew who report sick to CMS via email provide certified copy of instructions to CMS staff asking them not to mark the concerned Cabin crew SL or make any changes to his/her roster on Arms system till either any one or both of the following two conditions are met

i) Instructions of Air India doctor are received on the same

ii) Proof of sickness is provided by the cabin crew reporting sick.

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(19) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107345

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many times did the undersigned operate flight pattern AI-153?
2. Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many times did the undersigned operate flight pattern AI-135?
3. Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many times did the undersigned operate flight pattern AI-121?
4. Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many times did the undersigned operate flight pattern AI-157?
5. Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many times did the undersigned operate flight pattern AI-302?
6. Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many times did the undersigned operate flight pattern AI-308?
7. Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many times did the undersigned operate flight pattern AI-1 67?
8. Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many times did the undersigned operate flight pattern AI-103?
10. Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many times did the undersigned operate flight pattern 4V173?
11. Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many times did the undersigned operate flight pattern AI-161?
12. Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many times did the undersigned operate flight pattern AI-111?

13. *Between 1.11.2015 & 31.1.2018 how many times did the undersigned operate flight pattern AI-113?*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(20) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107346

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. *Reference is made to email sent to the undersigned by Duty Manager CMS (attached. as Annexure-A)*
 - a) *What is meant by the phrase "REQUIRED PROCESS will be initiated" mentioned in the said e-mail?*
 - b) *Provide List of all steps that the "Required Process" consist of?*
 - c) *Who all at CMS are authorized to initiate the 'required process without instructions of Air India Doctor'?*
 - d) *Provide certified copy of document that explains the "REQUIRED PROCESS" mentioned by Duty Manager CMS*
2. *Provide certified copy of instructions/guidelines issued to the duty manager CMS to*
 - a) *Refer to Air India Doctor each and every case of a cabin crew requesting Casual leave on medical grounds.*
 - b) *Refer to Air India doctor each and every case where cabin crew is seen requesting for casual Leave along with proof of admittance in a hospital.*
 - c) *Not to remove next assignment even when it is evident that the concerned crew member would be unable to undertake the same.*
3. *Provide certified copy of instructions/issued to Duty Manager CMS to refer to Air India doctor every case where the cabin crew requesting Casual Leave on medical grounds is already admitted in a hospital empaneled with Air India.*
4. *Provide certified copy of instructions/issued to Duty Manager CMS to refer to Air India doctor every case where the cabin crew requesting Casual Leave on medical grounds is under treatment of a doctor who isn't employed with Air India.*
5. *Provide certified copy of instructions to planning section of CMS asking them not to remove flight assignment A1933 of 31st Jan 2018 for the undersigned.*
6. *For 30th Jan 2018 provide content of all toggles/memo/remarks placed on the ARMS system of the undersigned along with the time, name and staff number of the CMS employee whose login I'd was used for the same.*
7. *Provide certified copy of instructions to the concerned CMS staff to place each toggle/memo/remark on the ARMS system for the undersigned on 30/01/2018*

8. *Provide certified copy of the attendance record for 30th Jan 2018 along-with Time of logging in and out of duty for all Duty Managers of CMS.*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(21) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107347

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. *As per CMS What is the meaning of "Smooth Operations" referred to in various official email communications?*
2. *Provide certified copy of document/ manuals relied upon by CMS staff wherein "smooth operations" are explained. What is the meaning of 'NTS' on ARMS PORTAL?*
3. *Provide Certified copy of guidelines issued to CMS staff for marking cabin crew "NTS" on the ARMS system.*
4. *Provide copy of instructions to CMS staff wherein it's conveyed that Cabin crew who seek information under The RTI Act 2005 should be:*
 - a) *marked NTS*
 - b) *assigned quick turn around flights as far as possible*
 - c) *on sectors operated by 787 aircraft only be assigned flights comprising layover less than 30 hours.*
 - d) *primarily assigned standby duties*
 - e) *assigned 65 or less flight hours in a calendar month*
 - f) *Never be assigned a flight pattern with two or more clear days layover across the company's entire flight network. Etc.*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(22) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107348

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. *On 20.02.2018 roster on ARMS for Wide Body cabin crew was released up to which date?*

2. *On 20.02.2018 List all assignments that were reflecting on the ARMS system for the undersigned from 20.02.2018 till the date the roster was released for.*
3. *On 26.02.2018 List all assignments that were reflecting on the ARMS system for the undersigned from 26.02.2018 till 20.03.2018*
4. *On 28/02/2018 List all assignments that were reflecting on the ARMS system for the undersigned from 28.02.2018 till 20.03.2018*
5. *Provide the name, staff number and hours of duty of each duty manager who did duty at CMS on 20.2.2018 between 0001 and 2359 hours.*
6. *Provide the name, staff number and hours of duty of each duty manager who did duty at CMS on 21.02.2018 between 0001 and 2359 hours.*
7. *List all the flights that were assigned to the undersigned from 01/03/2018 to 20/03/2018 when roster for March 2018 was released.*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(23) CIC/ABQAS /A/2019/107349/AIRIN

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. *What action was taken by Mr. Neeraj upon receipt of above mentioned email?*
2. *Was the above mentioned email forwarded to any email address?*
3. *At what time and to which email address was the above mentioned email forwarded by Duty Manager CMS?*
4. *Provide a certified copy of the reply sent to the above mentioned e-mail by CMS*
5. *Was the leave request refused by Mr. Neeraj? If "yes" Provide copy of the reason thereof communicated by the Duty Manager.*
6. *Provide copy of response from Mr. Neeraj, Duty Manager - CMS informing that the documents provided are insufficient to grant leave.*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(24) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107350

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. *Provide the name, designation and staff Number of CMS staff who responded to the email sent by me to CMS on 21.2.2018 bearing subject "Request for leave or reinstatement of bid flight"*
2. *Provide Certified copy of documents/guidelines relied upon by Mr. Himanshu Chopra at CMS to realign gaps between time off getting over and subsequent flight assignments?*
3. *Is removal of next assignment after time off the only method followed by CMS to realign gap between time off getting over and next assignment?*
4. *List all available methods available with CMS staff to realign gaps between time off getting over and next flight assignment.*
5. *Can a gap between time off getting over and next flight assignment be filled by assigning other flights (single or multiple)?*
6. *As per policy followed at CMS minimum gap of how many hours between time off getting over and reporting of next flight assignment requires a realignment of the gap using methods like removing next flight assignment?*
7. *In the winter cycle for 2017-2018 how many Cabin crew that had NEITHER reported sick nor were assigned any official training had their flights REMOVED 15 days or more in advance?*
8. *Does CMS have an official policy of assigning each cabin crew first available flight after his/her time off gets over?*
9. *Is a cabin crew always assigned standby duty of the first shift to start after time off gets over?*
10. *Once time off gets over Is cabin crew always assigned the first flight that he/she can Legally operate?*
11. *When the number of cabin crew available to operate a flight pattern exceeds the number of vacancies for the same, how is it decided whom to assign the flight? Is it done*
 - i) alphabetically in order of first name of crew*
 - ii) Alphabetically in order of surname of crew*
 - iii) In ascending order of staff number*
 - iv) In descending order of staff number*
 - v) As per seniority vi) Any other method please provide details*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

(25) CIC/AIRIN/A/2019/107351

The Appellant vide RTI application dated 10.08.2018 sought the following information:

1. *For Delhi base wide body cabin crew; as on 20.2.2018 what were the official contact numbers of CMS (landline & cell phone).*
2. *Provide Certified copy of circular informing the Cabin crew of the official landline and mobile contact numbers of CMS, CMS Duty Manager.*
3. *Does CMS have a dedicated 24 hour emergency contact number for cabin crew to contact CMS in case of distress? If "Yes" then*
 - a) *provide copy of communication informing the cabin crew of the same.*
 - b) *what is the dedicated emergency contact number set up at CMS?*
4. *Is there a female staff posted at CMS exclusively to be contacted by female cabin crew regarding their issues personal and/or medical? If "Yes" then*
 - a) *Provide the name, staff number, designation and official contact details of the lady posted.*
5. *Does there exist a training program for male employees of CMS department sensitising them to respect women & how to behave & communicate politely with female colleagues?*
6. *As on 20.02.2018 total how many male staff of CMS department have been Imparted training to sensitise them to respect women & how to behave & communicate politely with female colleagues?*
7. *In CMS department does there exist an employee named "Team CMS"?*
8. *In official email communication from CMS what is the meaning of the phrase "Team CMS" when used to conclude an e-mail:*
 - a) *without a senders name or designation*
 - b) *with a senders name but no designation*
9. *Provide Certified copy of documents/manuals relied upon by CMS staff where in "Team CMS" is defined/ explained.*
10. *Which CMS employee/s is/are authorised to send official email communication on behalf of CMS department under the pseudo name "Team CMS"*

(Queries reproduced verbatim)

The CPIO, CMS(Crew Management System) vide letter dated 14.09.2018 informed the Appellant that 44 RTIs filed by the Appellant had been received by them, containing numerous questions in each of the application, between 25thMay 2018 to 10thAugust 2018. The Respondent further stated that the questionnaires seem repetitive and on similar issues/subjects and a lot of questions fall in the category of third party information apart from being voluminous in nature. The Appellant was informed that the wide ranging information sought by her would require compilation and collection of voluminous data, thereby diverting the resources disproportionately. Hence CPIO took recourse of Section 7(9) of the RTI Act, 2005, to decline the information. However, the Appellant was advised to co-ordinate with the PIO for convenient date to avail the information as per provisions of the RTI Act, 2005.

Dissatisfied with the reply received from the CPIO, Appellant filed First Appeals dated 08.10.2018. FAA vide letter dated 12.11.2018 replied as under:

“We are in receipt of 25 RTI applications received in the office of the undersigned that were submitted earlier to CPIO, CMS, GSD Complex, IGI Airport, New Delhi.

Please be informed that the same have been forwarded to the concerned department (CMS) and the CPIO, CMS has been advised for an early reply to the said RTI applications.”

Feeling aggrieved as dissatisfied, Appellant approached the Commission with the instant Second Appeals.

Decision:

1. The current situation arising out of the COVID-19 pandemic, has resulted in significant disruption in the functioning of public establishments and businesses alike. In respect of the Commission, this has translated into a mounting backlog of Appeals and Complaints. In such circumstances, there is a pressing need to identify cases such as the ones under adjudication for combined disposal in order to facilitate expedient disposal of cases of genuine information seekers. In other words, this is where the aforementioned juxtaposition comes into play as the Commission seeks to strike a fine balance between the interests of genuine information seekers, while keeping the menace of repetitive RTI Applicants under check.
2. Keeping in view the facts and circumstances in the aforesaid cases and the adverse impact of COVID-19 on normal functioning of public officials as well as their deployment to combat the pandemic, holding

structured physical hearings of the above cases is not deemed expedient in the current situation as it will only delay the dissemination of the desired information.

3. The aforementioned batch of twenty five Second Appeals have been filed by a single Appellant-Smt. Deeksha Chaudhary against Air India Limited, where the Appellant was employed. The appeals have arisen out of an employer-employee dispute over leave availed by the Appellant. The Appellant has raised myriad queries including seeking rules, guidelines, criteria of cabin crew scheduling under department "Crew Management System; details of flight allocation on certain routes along with process for granting leave etc.
4. The RTI applications have been responded to by the PIO stating that since the queries are repetitive and require compilation of huge volume of data, which would lead to disproportionate diversion of resources, as defined under Section 7(9) of the RTI Act, the Appellant may contact the PIO at the given telephone number to obtain information as per provisions of the RTI Act. The First Appeals filed by the FAA have been decided by one common order dated 12.11.2018, directing the CPIO, CMS to furnish an early response to the Appellant.
5. The resolution of all the aforementioned cases lies in addressing the grievance(s) of the Appellant through the information to be provided by the CPIO, CMS, Air India, as directed by the FAA. Thus it is necessary to ascertain the compliance of the FAA's order dated 12.11.2018. In order to expedite dissemination of the information and ensure compliance of the FAA's order, it is thus deemed expedient that the 25 second appeals be remanded to the FAA to ensure compliance of his/her earlier order dated 12.11.2018 in response to the Appellant's first appeals, in order to address the central issue agitated by the Appellant. The Respondent shall submit a detailed compliance report before this Commission by 28.02.2021. It is made clear that non-compliance of these directions shall attract penal action, as envisaged in the Act.

The above mentioned Second Appeals are thus disposed off with these directions.

Y. K. Sinha (वाई. के.सिन्हा)
Chief Information Commissioner(मुख्य सूचना आयुक्त)

Authenticated true copy

(अभिप्रमाणितसत्यापितप्रति)

S. K. Chitkara (एस. के. चिटकारा)
Dy. Registrar (उप-पंजीयक)
011-26180514



